ARTICLE

Comparative Study

Dimension Policy of Smart People in Metropolitan City of Bandung, Jakarta, and Pekanbaru

Baskoro Wicaksono (1) 1 M, Refaldo Asta (1) 2, M. Rafi (1) 3

^{1,2}Department of Governmental Science, University of Riau, Pekanbaru, Riau, Indonesia

³Masters in Governmental Science, Yogyakarta Muhammadiyah University, Bantul, Yogyakarta, Indonesia

baskoro.wicaksono@lecturer.unri.ac.id

Abstract: The advancement of information and communication technology (ICT) has become a major focus that is often seen in Indonesia's concept of smart cities. As a result, various stakeholders often ignore smart people's dimensions, which have an essential role in realizing a smart city. Therefore, this study aims to explain and compare various smart people policies in metropolitan cities such as Bandung, Jakarta, and Pekanbaru. This study uses literature study research techniques sourced from journals, proceedings, books, and official government websites that provide information relevant to the study's focus. The results showed that smart people's policy dimensions in Bandung, Jakarta, and Pekanbaru consist of three policy dimensions, namely policies at the education level, creative industry policies, and Smart City Living Lab policies. In the education sector policy, the Municipal Governments of Bandung, Jakarta, and Pekanbaru have the same program orientation. Then, the creative industry sector policy has a different program orientation, where the city of Bandung focuses on developing the Little Bandung website, Jakarta focuses on the One District One Center (OK OCE) program. In contrast, Pekanbaru focuses on the Madani Food Week program. Furthermore, the policies in the Smart City Living Lab sector in Bandung, Jakarta, and Pekanbaru have not focused on the parameters of the small-scale smart city development model.

Keywords: smart people; smart city; policy



Citation: Wicaksono, B., Asta, R., & Rafi, M. (2021). Comparative Study: Dimension Policy of Smart People in Metropolitan City of Bandung, Jakarta, and Pekanbaru. *Jurnal Bina Praja*, 13(1), 93–103. https://doi.org/10.21787/jpb.13.2021.93-103

Received: January 17, 2021 Accepted: April 6, 2021 Published: April 30, 2021

© The Author(s)

This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 4.0 International License.

1. Introduction

In nowadays, government institutions must adapt to the development of the era in each of their governmental activities. In Indonesia, Indonesia, precisely in the second decade of the 2000 millennium, has found many cities that have implemented the smart city concept (Amrullah, 2019). There is a contemporary city development concept that has begun to develop in the last ten years. For example, Bandung, Jakarta, and Surabaya are big cities on Java that continue to grow and become barometers for other cities in Indonesia regarding the Smart City concept's implementation. (Endang & Gunartin, 2019; Firmanyah et al., 2017). Smart concept solutions are not just technological infrastructure approaches such as building roads, displacing residential areas, and increasing mass transportation. However, it is broader, more strategic, and more inclusive, such as developing attitudes, lifestyles, and socio-cultural trends that follow the local community's conditions. (Ahmadjayadi, 2016; Ramdani & Habibi, 2017).

Smart city has become a trending topic in Indonesia (Offenhuber, 2019). This concept provides opportunities for transforming technology-based information and communication services (Supangkat et al., 2018). The idea of a smart city is an alternative to solving urban problems and ensuring a livable city even during a relatively fast urban population growth (Firmanyah et al., 2017). The development of a smart city is to improve the quality of life by utilizing urban information and technology to increase service efficiency and meet its citizens' needs (Susanti et al., 2016). Information and communication technology allows stakeholders to interact directly with the public (Mahesa et al., 2019). In essence, a smart city is an effective and efficient urban management concept to solve various city challenges by using innovative, integrated, and sustainable solutions (Batty, 2018). Every city whose residents can adopt a smart city's idea can implement a sustainable smart city (Mahesa et al., 2019; Putri & Darmawan, 2018; Widodo & Permatasari, 2020). The concept of a smart city will encourage the management of any city government to become more effective and efficient (Kumar, 2020). The use of technological advances will facilitate every government function with complex problems (Andhika, 2017; Huda& Yunas, 2016; Napitupulu, 2016; Siddique, 2016). Besides, in terms of governance in a city, smart cities will also be able to include improvements to designs based on information and communication technology (Pramesti et al., 2020; Rafi et al., 2020).

Generally, academics and government practitioners think that the smart city concept's primary orientation is developing information and communication technology. Government policies that want to implement a smart city seem to focus only on information and technology development (Gunartin, 2018). Then, even though the various collaborations carried out by the Ministry of Communication and Information, Ministry of Home Affairs, Kemenpan-RB, Value Added Tax, and the Ministry of Public Works and Housing have initiated the implementation of the program towards 100 Smart Cities, various challenges are still faced by different government institutions at the local level because the realization is not only about development from the aspects of information and technology, but must also pay attention to other aspects such as social, environmental, business and management, energy, and other industries(Utomo& Hariadi, 2016; Dirjen Aplikasi Informatika, 2017; Mahesa et al., 2019). There are two main principles of a smart city, namely a concept based on information, and communication (ICT), which is commonly known as physical infrastructure (hard infrastructure), and a concept that focuses on culture, social, and inclusion which is usually called soft infrastructure (Arafah & Winarso, 2020). The more than two thousand Scopus articles published about smart cities, 50 percent on technology studies, while others only discuss the concept of smart cities from various other fields of science, such as social sciences, climate, etc. This is very contradicting. The implementation process and the achievement of the smart city concept are both important to prioritize (Arafah & Winarso, 2020; Colding & Barthel, 2017).

Currently, Indonesia's 100 smart city program still faces urban challenges such as urbanization, traffic congestion, poverty, and criminalization. Then, the mismatch between supply and demand also affects the suboptimal implementation of smart cities (Mahesa et al., 2019). In addition, it was also influenced by the Covid-19 Pandemic and the discovery of acts of regulatory violations in the implementation of the program. Thus, important steps that must be taken in implementing a Smart City are technology, innovation, and collaboration. The use of technology is an effort to create innovative cities, developed cities, and happy communities. Furthermore, the future of smart cities in Indonesia will depend on good collaboration and cooperation between stakeholders in solving urban problems. Of course, this role is the government's responsibility and demands the community, startups, the private sector, and the community to play an active role in it. The realization of these three things is an essential step in resolving urban problems and efforts to meet the needs of citizens(Terralogiq.com, 2021).

According to Papa et al. (2015) stated that smart city concept could be divided into three main categories: First, it only focuses on physical infrastructure (hardware), which is often called a smart city as a digital city. Second, it focuses on software that is recognized as a smart city as a socially inclusive city. Third, focusing on "hardware" and "software" makes the smart city concept a city with a high quality of life. From this development stage, the strengthening of the smart people dimension begins to appear in the second stage and is more dominant in the third stage. However, strengthening the dimensions of smart people must be prepared in advance. These dimensions require a long time for the main control to exist in the community or the population of the city(Madakam, 2020). According to Central Bureau of Statistics (BPS) data of 2010, it is showed that the population living in urban areas was 49.8 percent of the total national population. The percentage increased in 2015 to 53.3 percent. It is estimated that in 2020 it will be 56.7 percent (Yudantoro, 2016).

Based on empirical studies in previous research, Bandung and Surabaya are two examples of the application of smart cities in Indonesia that have produced positive results. Where these two cities have become the barometer of smart cities in Indonesia (Pramesti et al., 2020; Satrio & Rochani, 2019). City residents are required to be smart and proficient in using technology effectively (Pramesti et al., 2020). The policies taken in each city to strengthen smart people's dimensions in implementing the smart city concept are different. It will have implications for the effectiveness of programs that are realized in the community, where the citizens of the city are the subject of the embodiment of the dimensions of smart people (Suhartono & Zulkarnain, 2019). Various city government policy programs to improve the dimensions of smart people have not been based on the population background and in-depth studies for the realization of this dimension. So that the policies taken do not take into account the differences in the character of the population of each city and are not based on academic studies (Hasibuan Sulaiman, 2019), for this reason, the realization of the smart people policy should also consider aspects of political interest, business community needs(Graha, 2020).

In general, the dimensions of smart people have seven key factors, namely skills and levels of education, lifelong learning, social and ethnic diversity, as well as involvement in the life of the public sphere, flexibility, mobility, creativity, and open-mindedness (Arafah & Winarso, 2020; Pramesti et al., 2020). Then, smart people's dimensions that are desired as a fundamental part of smart city development are city residents who are always ready and adapt to learn new techniques for a better life.(Pramesti et al., 2020; Madakam, 2020). In addition, most of the population and students can use smartphones and learn independently from various platforms (Anityasari, 2019; Madakam, 2020). Therefore, this study will compare various dimensions of smart people policies in metropolitan cities, namely Bandung, Jakarta, and Pekanbaru. This study is important because various researches appear to be still limited and have not shown studies that focus on specific policies in the dimensions of smart people in Indonesia.

2. Methods

This study uses a qualitative approach with a descriptive-exploratory literature review approach. The important reason for choosing the locus of this research is that the cities of Bandung, Jakarta, and Pekanbaru are metropolitan cities and smart cities' pioneering areas. The three of them make the Smart City Tagline in every formulation of policies and programs. The data used in this study come from primary and secondary sources. Primary sources consist of national and international journals, proceedings, and books that directly address the research topic. Secondary sources are sources not directly related to the topic (Hermawan, 2019).

The data collection techniques were conducted by reading, taking notes, selecting data, and categorizing data. In detail, the activity begins with reading literature related to research, then continues by recording these materials to expand the required information. The next stage held a selection of data that has been obtained. Data categorization was carried out as the final stage to be included in the appropriate sub-discussions and a triangulation process. According to Creswell (2014) stated, triangulation is a research process conducted by the author by comparing information from various sources and a comprehensive check and recheck process. Analysis of the data that has been obtained uses qualitative descriptive analysis by reducing data, presenting data as well as clarifying the truth of the data as a whole by comparing between data and drawing conclusions.

3. Results and Discussion

3.1. Government Policy Parameters in Strengthening Smart People Dimensions

Strengthening the smart people's dimension in Indonesia aimed to realize a civil society where all human resources in a community have become capable or qualified (Suhartono & Zulkarnain, 2019). The Smart People dimension will be formed if the goal of forming civil society can be achieved. According to Giffingger et al., in their analysis, the six dimensions of a smart city have indicators in each dimension (Giffinger, Rudolf; Fertner, 2007). Because this study focuses on the dimensions of smart people, it has general indicators:

SMART PEOPLE (Social and Human Capital)

- · Level of qualification
- · Affinity to life long learning
- The social and ethnic plurality
- Flexibility
- Creativity
- Cosmopolitanism/Open-mindedness
- · Participation in public life

In general, a city can be said to have succeeded in strengthening smart people's dimensions when the city community has qualified individuals' ability, is sensitive to the environment and general issues so that there is a political will from city residents to participate in. Because this indicator is still relatively known, it needs to be narrowed down to make it more substantial. Giffingger specifies indicators into parameters on the dimensions of smart people, which are termed social and human capital.

Based on Table 1, smart people's dimensions consist of three parts, namely supporting indicators (inclusion), which measure the ability of the population to adapt to technological developments, especially the internet. Then on the education indicators (education), namely the focus of smart people on further education in the city and the number of college graduates. Then on the indicators of urban citizen

Figure 1. General Smart People Indicator

Table 1. Smart People Dimension Specifications

Smart People		Internet-connected Households
	Inclusion	Smartphone penetration
		Civic engagement
	Fdustin	Secondary Education
	Education	University Graduates
	Creativity	Foreign-born immigrants
		Urban Living Lab
		Creative Industry Jobs

creativity targeting the realization of human resource development, for example, the development of the creative economy. From the indicators on the dimensions of smart people analyzed by these experts, government policies are parameters to realize a smart city. This parameter is called the Boyd Cohen Smart City Wheel 27 parameters. Three parameters are part of increasing the dimensions of smart people.

The first parameter is the population who completed education above the compulsory education program. If the compulsory education program has covered SD and SLTP levels for nine years, then the population who has completed high school education (SMA / SMK equivalent) has fulfilled this parameter's criteria. The second parameter is the number of people who work in the creative industry in a city. This parameter is following Boyd Cohen's opinion. According to him, a smart city is an approach to increase city operations' efficiency the quality of life, and grow the local economy (Gunartin, 2018). The creative industry's development is classified as a crucial parameter based on expert analysis regarding these smart people's dimensions. The third parameter is the existence of an urban living lab in a city. Urban Living Lab in Indonesia, known as the Smart City Living Lab, is a small-scale smart city model in certain areas. With limited human resources, the government can invest in researchers, developers, and innovation projects in solving urban problems by using support from living labs (Amrullah, 2019). Because the city government's role in the parameters of connecting the population to the internet is classified as not large, but the private sector has extra influence, especially since the three cities that will be compared already have a comprehensive internet connection. So it can be ascertained that the focus of realizing the dimension of smart people is in the innovation of government programs in the form of policies in the field of education, namely increasing the number of residents who have graduated from high school education, then government efforts to stimulate and develop the population to be more involved in the creative industry and the operation of the urban living lab/smart city living lab.

3.2. Policies for Implementing Smart People Dimensions in Bandung, Jakarta, and Pekanbaru

Indeed, there are no policies specifically aimed at strengthening the dimensions of smart people in each city in question. But from the indicators and parameter specifications described earlier, city government policies can be categorized to realize the strengthening of smart people's dimension. Here the researchers describe the city government's policies in realizing the dimensions of smart people in Bandung, Jakarta, and Pekanbaru.

1. Bandung

In realizing the city of Bandung, the Smart City concept is not easy. The population does not have access to detailed information, and people are not fully aware of the technology. Many people cannot access the internet or other media, so that information is not conveyed. Issues related to the socialization carried out by the Bandung Government are still not optimal (Ramdani & Habibi, 2017). In general, this is the initial representation that exists in Bandung city residents.

Bandung continues to innovate so that the programs it runs can contribute to the idea of a smart city in the millennial era with the characteristics of its society. One example that has been taken is opening up spaces for public involvement freely in response to government (Ramdani & Habibi, 2017). Bandung is the most significant contributor to regional income and economy in this area. West Java's capital is a center for IT applications for fashion, film production, music, architecture, art, and innovation. There are several active arts and cultures dominated by young people. Fashion and music are the leading creative industries as a strengthening of the Smart People dimension. Bandung's clothing trademark in the form of T-shirts, shirts, pants, and other clothes is the main attraction for shopping.

Bandung develops creative industries implementing sister city programs with the cities of Seoul (South Korea), Petaling Jaya (Malaysia), and Namur (Belgium). Sister city is implemented to develop the smart city of each city. Bandung has made a breakthrough, namely the "little Bandung" program, especially for the creative industry's promotion and development. This program aims to promote the creative industry, especially the micro, small and medium enterprises in Bandung, by opening outlets that sell original Bandung products in cities that are sister city partners. However, after the Little Bandung program was implemented, it turned out to be ineffective. For example, in Petaling Jaya, Malaysia. Constrained by budget availability, while the income earned is relatively low. The reason for the closure was due to the completion of the cooperation contract. The Bandung city government's solution when the little Bandung outlet in its sister city partner city was discontinued was to open a website. Through this website, prospective buyers can buy various local Bandung products (Detik.com, 2018).

Moreover, in the education sector, the average length of school for Bandung City residents in 2017 is 10.59 years or the equivalent of class 10 SMA. This is higher than the average length of schooling for West Java residents for 8.14 years (Ayobandung. com, 2018). The Bandung Champion Card Program is a Smart card intended for students who fall into underprivileged students in every public and private education unit. As many as 80,000 elementary and junior high school students get cards to start the new school year. This card also applies to high school level students even though the Provincial Government has held the management. The allocation is divided into two, namely 141 billion for SD, SMP, and SMA RMP students in private schools. Meanwhile, for public schools, namely SD and SMP, the budget is estimated at 70 billion, with the target of elementary, junior high school students for public and private schools (Jabarnews.com, 2018).

The smart city living lab in Bandung is only at the planning stage of development. This plan was announced in May 2019. In implementing the smart city living lab, Bandung City collaborated with the Bandung Institute of Technology (ITB), where the two parties were researching potential areas for locations. In connection with the Smart City Maturity Model, ITB and the City Government will conduct a series of environmental and social ecosystem trials in these locations. This modeling is expected to see the extent to which smart cities can change the paradigm of society to become smarter by changing behavior and culture to become more sophisticated and civilized (Https://humas.bandung.go.id/, 2019). Regional Work Units that are involved, namely the Department of Transportation, the Office of Public Works, Department of Spatial Planning, Department of Education, and regional officials, play a role in determining the location (Https://republika.co.id/, 2019).

2. Jakarta

The focus of the city of Jakarta with regard to the dimensions of smart people is on improving the quality of human resources and decent living facilities. Smart People with culture is the fourth mission in Jakarta Smart City, namely by developing a tolerant urban environment while preserving the area (Endang & Gunartin, 2019). The use of transportation, namely Massa Rapid Transportation (MRT), Line Rapid Transportation (LRT), shows smart people for residents and Jakarta's provincial government, especially in the transportation service sector. However, the current limitations of

Massa Rapid Transportation (MRT) and Line Rapid Transportation (LRT) certainly cause only a few Jakartans to use this smart transportation service. The existence of the QLUE application as a forum for Jakarta's participation in development has turned out to be very effective. This is due to the prevalence of a fast and stable internet network in the city of Jakarta.

In the context of the creative industry itself, the OK OCE program has been implemented in Jakarta. It is one sub-district, one center for entrepreneurship (1 sub-district, 1 training center) to grow entrepreneurs in Jakarta. Based on data collected in the Jawa pos editorial team, in Jakarta, there are five One sub-District One Center (OK OCE) Mart and four One sub-District One Center (OK OCE) outlets. Apart from that, the positive impact of the One sub-District One Center (OK OCE) program is many and the rise of startups such as food that moves online and others. That means the One sub-District One Center (OK OCE) program has been able to grow the creative industry in Jakarta.

In the education sector, based on data from the Central Bureau of Statistics, most of the population of DKI Jakarta (38.33%) has completed education up to the high school level. Then, the population who entered tertiary institutions and graduated (16.01%) consisted of diploma graduates (4.57%) and undergraduate graduates (11.51%). This means that around 55% of Jakarta City's population has completed 12 years of education. In other words, it has met the parameter of the number of high school graduates and equivalent based on Giffingger's analysis. The government's breakthrough targeting the education sector is the Jakarta Smart Plus Card (KJP Plus) program. The education and social sector program, which was originally in the form of KJP, is now being upgraded to KJP Plus; with KJP Plus, the community will receive not only non-cash assistance but also cash assistance (Muluk et al., 2019).

The existence of a smart city living lab in Jakarta is inseparable from the influence of the largest telecommunications company, namely PT. Telkom Indonesia Tbk (Telkom). Since 2016 the company has developed a smart city living lab in the Kemayoran area, Central Jakarta. The smart city modeling developed by Telkom is called "Telkom Lab Smart City Nusantara." Smart City Nusantara Living Lab is a facility developed in 2016 in guidance and knowledge about smart city implementation for smart city stakeholders. Especially local governments for digital transformation in the local government sector and accelerate the use of ICT technology to realize smart cities. In addition, each local government can visit information sharing, implementation discussions, technology, and business innovation. Living Lab Smart City Nusantara has more than 70 demo smart city solutions until 2019 and has received more than 550 visits from Indonesia's government, business, and community sectors from various parties. This is expected to encourage a collaborative spirit to accelerate the growth of Indonesia's digital (Https://www.telkom.co.id/, 2019).

Since April 2018, the DKI Jakarta Provincial Government has committed to making Telkom Lab Smart City Nusantara a partner in developing the smart city concept in the City of Jakarta. According to the Provincial government website's official statement, Smart City will not stop at the smart city concept and encourage urban progress or social, economic, and environmental growth. By offering data-driven solutions. Together with Smart City Nusantara, the DKI Provincial Government is ready to present sustainable urban solutions (Https://jakarta.go.id/, 2018).

3. Pekanbaru

Pekanbaru began to focus on the development of a smart city in 2017, previously in the period 2012 to 2017 barometer on the metropolitan concept. Meanwhile, starting in 2017, Pekanbaru City shifted and focused as a smart city. The city government considers this a concept shift, from the concept of "Pekanbaru Metropolitan Madani" to the concept of development of "Pekanbaru Smart City Madani." From the development concept socialized by the city government alone, it can be seen that the focus of smart cities in Pekanbaru is on strengthening the dimensions of Smart People (civil society). In the dimension of smart people, the city government is targeting the realization of civil society. Civil society, according to the city government of Pekanbaru, is a society that

is spiritually and physically healthy, intelligent (educated, skilled, mastering civilized technology), noble and cultured. Processed from various data obtained by the author, the strategy of Pekanbaru city in realizing smart people in the form of pre-marriage preparation, preparation since in the womb, toddler nutrition programs, education of children at home by parents, children's education in schools, and education in the community.

To realize these strategies, the city government of Pekanbaru launched a smart card program. Namely, the "Madani Smart Card" and "Children's Identity Card" programs which the city government thinks are useful or have more value than just an identity for the owner (Haifulloh et al., 2020). This card is used to access public services that the city government has provided to use it to buy and sell transactions or services that can help accelerate the development of the economy in Pekanbaru City itself. The use of this card is divided into banking and non-banking. Use of banking to access transportation services, taxes/levies, and non-cash transactions. Meanwhile, nonbanking is to access services in the fields of education, health, and licensing. This card can also be used as savings and access to various services (Pekanbaru.go.id, 2019). In realizing the development of smart cities, especially the smart card program, namely in collaboration with Bank Indonesia (BI) and Bank Nasional Indonesia (BNI). This policy is directly correlated with the increasing number of senior high school graduates in Pekanbaru City. This is consistent with the smart people parameter outlined by Giffingger. If implemented successfully and optimally, this card will certainly continue to maintain and even increase the population with high school education and above which is already at 54.25 percent.

Besides, in developing creative industries or micro, small, and medium enterprises, Pekanbaru tries to promote city residents' creativity, one of which is through the civil food week. The civil food week is sponsored by the food security service to help small and medium enterprises market their agricultural products with various kinds of preparations (Remahan.com, 2020). Unlike of Bandung, the advertising sector is the main creative industry in Pekanbaru City. In 2015 the advertising sector was able to absorb 607 workers (Situmorang, 2015). However, the government has not yet paid particular attention to this sector. The city government's special attention in the creative industry lies with the Regional National Craft Council. It collaborates with the Department of Industry and Trade to provide direct guidance to creative industry players. This regional work unit coordinates with SMEs fostered from the Regional National Craft Council related to product promotion and packaging so that it is feasible to penetrate the national market. In this program, there are several activities carried out, such as the results of the processing of micro, small and medium enterprises and opening stands at every government or public event (Kiblatriau.com, 2019).

Meanwhile, in the development parameters of a smart city living lab in Pekanbaru City, there is currently no plan to build a small-scale smart city modeling. However, the city government visited the Telkom Lab Smart City Nusantara in April 2019. Telkom is committed to helping the Pekanbaru City Government find solutions to problems experienced by the Pekanbaru City Government to accelerate sustainable smart city development in Pekanbaru City. In 2019, the Telkom Group developed 68 prototypes and demo solutions, which are believed to be able to solve urban problems for smart city growth. There are four types of demonstration of smart city officer solutions at the Living Lab Smart City Nusantara according to their uses and are located in 4 areas, namely smart government, smart business, smart people, and smart infrastructure zones (Https://www.indotelko.com/2019).

3.3. Comparison of Smart People Dimensions Policy in Bandung, Jakarta, and Pekanbaru

The policies taken by the respective city governments of Bandung, Jakarta, and Pekanbaru can be compared and have differences and similarities. The comparisons are described in Table 2.

Table 2. Summary of differences in policies for strengthening the dimensions of Smart People

		Smart People parameter				
No	City	Creative Industry	Population Education Level	Urban Living Lab		
1	Bandung	Bandung Litle is a marketing innovation and product development through its sister city program (Seoul, South Korea, Petaling Jaya Malaysia, and the city of Namur, Belgium).	Bandung Champion Card is a smart card for the category of students prone to continuing education (RMP).	The planning phase of the Smart City Living Lab development in collaboration with ITB (Bandung Institute of Technology)		
2	Jakarta	The establishment of OK OCE (One Sub-district, One Center of Entrepreneurship) is a program of fostering and developing creative industries based on MSMEs.	The Jakarta Smart Plus Card (KJP Plus), starting with KJP and then upgraded to KJP Plus, is a smart card for students consisting of noncash and cash subsidies.	The Telkom company made the Smart City Living Lab located in the city of Jakarta, which is called "Smart City Nusantara," operating since 2016		
3	Pekanbaru	Creative Industry Development (MSMEs) through collaboration between regional, national craft councils and the Department of Industry and Trade	Child Identity Card and Madani Smart Card are smart cards that are used to access various public services and for savings.	There is no Urban Living Lab development plan. However, the city government of Pekanbaru has visited Telkom's Smart City Nusantara.		

Source: Researchers processed data, 2021.

4. Conclusion

The smart people dimension parameters are aimed at increasing the school graduation rate, developing creative industries, and adopting small-scale cities in the city area. Based on the analysis results, there are similarities and differences in policies related to strengthening the dimensions of smart people in each city that have been previously described. First, the parameter of increasing the number of high school graduates, each city has relatively the same policies through assistance programs and subsidies for students with a smart card platform. The Madani Smart Card in Pekanbaru City is used to access public services in banking and non-banking. In contrast, the Bandung Juara and KJP Plus cards have the main function of subsidizing students' educational needs who deserve to get them. Second, the development of the creative industry has differences in the focus of policies in each city. Bandung implements a policy that focuses on marketing and product introduction. Jakarta implements a policy on strengthening the structure of the creative industry.

Meanwhile, Pekanbaru's policy still seems conventional, namely by providing marketing space in every public event. Indeed, the focus is the same as Bandung, namely product marketing, but the Pekanbaru City government policy's marketing reach is still very local and narrow. Third, the parameters for establishing a small-scale smart city model (smart city living lab), Bandung has managed to take advantage of the

existence of the Bandung Institute of Technology even though it is still at the planning stage. Jakarta has the advantage of being the capital city, even though there is no contribution from the Jakarta Provincial Government to constructing a smart city living lab by this Telkom company. However, the flow of cooperation and coordination with Telkom has become easy because of establishment in the Jakarta area. Compared to Bandung and Jakarta, Pekanbaru City is the least concerned about this parameter. The Pekanbaru City Government is only at the initial exploration stage with its stakeholders.

References

- Abdurrozzaq Hasibuan, O. K. S. (2019). Smart City Konsep Kota Cerdas Sebagai Alternatif Penyelesaian Masalah Perkotaan Kabupaten/Kota Di Kota-Kota Besar Provinsi Sumatera Utara. Buletin Utama Teknik, 14(2), 127–135. https://jurnal.uisu.ac.id/index.php/but/article/view/1097/853
- Ahmadjayadi, C. (2016). Melesat Atau Kandas_ NEW INDONESIA(H. Kusdaryanto (Ed.); 1st Ed.). Elex Media Komputindo. Https://Doi.Org/716061990
- Amrullah, A. (2019). Smart City Dynamic Dashboard: Alternatif Kolaborasi Multi Aplikasi Pada Smart City Menggunakan Metode User-Driven Collaboration (Udc). Jurnal Teknoinfo, 13(1), 5. Https://Doi. Org/10.33365/Jti.V13i1.183
- Andhika, L. R. (2017). Negative Effects Of Open Government: (Good Governance In Relation To Open Government Initiatives). Jurnal Bina Praja, 9(2), 219–229. https://doi.org/10.21787/jbp.09.2017.219-229
- Anityasari, M. (2019). SMART CITY: Bunga Rampai Pengetahuan, Gagasan, &Rekomendasi ITS Untuk Indonesia. In T. Susanto (Ed.), Smart City: Konsep, Model Dan Teknologi(1st Ed.). AISINDO.
- Arafah, Y., &Winarso, H. (2020). Peningkatan Dan Penguatan Partisipasi Masyarakat Dalam Konteks Smart City. Tataloka, 22(1), 27–40. https://doi.org/10.14710/tataloka.22.1.27-40
- Ayobandung.Com. (2018). Apa Kabar Pendidikan Anak Di Kota Bandung?Ayobandung.Com.
- Batty, M. (2018). Artificial Intelligence And Smart Cities. Environment And Planning: Urban Analytics And City Science, 45(1), 3–6. https://Doi.org/10.1177/2399808317751169
- Chandra Eko Wahyudi Utomo, M. H. (2016). Strategi Pembangunan Smart City Dan Tantangannya Bagi Masyarakat Kota. Jurnal Strategi Dan Bisnis, 4(2), 159–176. https://repository.unej.ac.id/bitstream/handle/123456789/79312/4.%20Chandra.pdf?sequence=1
- Creswell, J. W. (2014). Penelitian Kualitatif Dan Desain Riset (Memilih Diantara Lima Pendekatan). In Pustaka Pelajar(Edisi 3). Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar.
- Detik.Com. (2018). Tidak Berkembang, Little Bandung Di Malaysia Ditutup. Detik.Com.
- Dyah Ratna Pramesti, Aulia Nur Kasiwi, E. P. P. (2020). Perbandingan Implementasi Smart City Di Indonesia: Studi Kasus Perbandingan Smart People Di Kota Surabaya Dan Kota Malang. International Journal Of Demos, 2(2), 163–173. https://Doi.org/10.37950/Iid.V2i2.61
- Endang, P. A., &Gunartin. (2019). Analisis Kota Jakarta Sebagai Smart City. Jurnal Ilmiah Ilmu Manajemen, 1(1), 41–58. http://openjournal.unpam.ac.id/index.php/Inovasi/article/view/3678
- Giffinger, Rudolf; Fertner, C. (2007). Smart Cities: Ranking Of European Mid-Sized Cities. In Digital Agenda For Europe(Issue October).
- Graha, I. M. S. (2020). Proses Kota Denpasar Menuju Smart City. Jurnal Litbang Sukowati: Media Penelitian Dan Pengembangan, 4(2), 11. https://Doi.Org/10.32630/Sukowati.V4i2.125
- Gunartin, G. (2018). Analisa Faktor-Faktor Kendala Ketercapaian Smart Mobility Dalam Upaya Menuju Konsep Smart City (Studi Pada Kota Tangerang Selatan). Inovasi, 5(2), 33. Https://Doi.org/10.32493/Inovasi V5i2 Y2018 P33-41
- Haifulloh, R., Purnomo, E. P., &Salsabila, L. (2020). Kehadiran Kartu Smart Madani Dan Kartu Identitas Anak Sebagai Program Pengembangan Smart City Di Kota Pekanbaru. Gorontalo Journal Of Government And Political Studies, 3(1), 038. https://Doi.org/10.32662/Gigops.V3i1.825
- Hendra Sandhi Firmanyah, Suhono H. Supangkat, Arry A. Arman, R. A. (2017). Searching Smart City In Indonesia Through Maturity Model Analysis (Case Study In 10 Cities). The International Conference On ICT For Smart Society (ICISS), 5, 1–6.
- Hermawan, I. (2019). Metodologi Penelitian Pendidikan Kuantitatif, Kualitatif Dan Mexod Method. Kuningan: Hidayatul Quran.
- Https://Humas.Bandung.Go.Id/. (2019). Pemkot Bandung Dan ITB Akan Bangun Smart City Living Lab. Https://Humas.Bandung.Go.Id/.
- Https://Jakarta.Go.Id/. (2018). Wagub Kunjungi Living Lab Smart City Nusantara _ Portal Resmi Pemerintah Provinsi DKI Jakarta. Https://Jakarta.Go.Id/.
- Https://Republika.Co.Id/. (2019). Pemkot Bandung-ITB Ciptakan Smart City Living Lab _ Republika Online. Https://Republika.Co.Id/.
- Https://Www.Indotelko.Com/. (2019). Pekanbaru Lirik Smart City Nusantara Tingkatkan Layanan Publik. Https://Www.Indotelko.Com/.
- Https://Www.Telkom.Co.Id/. (2019). Living Lab Smart City Nusantara Dukung Digitalisasi Kota/Kabupaten Di Indonesia. Https://Www.Telkom.Co.Id/.
- Informatika, D. J. A. (2017). Buku Panduan Penyusunan Masterplan Smart City 2017: Gerakan Menuju 100 Smart City. Kementerian Komunikasi Dan Informatika.
- Jabarnews.Com. (2018). Sebanyak 98 Ribu Pelajar Kota Bandung Dapatkan Kartu Bandung Juara. Jabarnews.Com.

- Johan Colding, S. B. (2017). An Urban Ecology Critique On The "Smart City" Model. Journal Of Cleaner Production, 164, 95–101. https://doi.org/10.1016/J.Jclepro.2017.06.191
- Kiblatriau.Com. (2019). Dekranasda Kota Pekanbaru Komitmen Untuk Kembangkan Industri Kreatif. Kiblatriau.Com.
- Kumar, T. M. V. (2020). Smart Living For Smart Cities: Community Study, Ways And Means. Springer Nature.
 Madakam, S. (2020). An Exploratory Case Study: Would Be Smart Balinese Cities (Indonesia). Journal
 Of Information Systems And Technology Management, 17(0). https://Doi.Org/10.4301/S1807-1775202017005
- Mahesa, R., Yudoko, G., &Anggoro, Y. (2019). Dataset On The Sustainable Smart City Development In Indonesia. Data In Brief, 25(June), 1–16. https://Doi.org/10.1016/J.Dib.2019.104098
- Mi'rojul Huda, N. S. Y. (2016). The Development Of E-Government System In Indonesia. Jurnal Bina Praja, 8(1), 97–108. http://Jurnal.Kemendagri.Go.Id/Index.Php/Jbp/Index The
- Muluk, A. P., Irbah, A., Bagastama, R. M., &Belakang, L. (2019). Analisis Implementasi Kebijakan Kartu Jakarta Pintar (Kjp) Plus Di Dki Jakarta. Ilmu Pemerintahan Unbraw.
- Napitupulu, D. (2016). E-Government Maturity Model Based On Systematic Review And Meta Ethnography Approach. Jurnal Bina Praja, 8(2), 263–275. https://Doi.org/10.21787/Jbp.08.2016.263-275
- Offenhuber, D. (2019). The Platform And The Bricoleur-Improvisation And Smart City Initiatives In Indonesia. EPB: Urban Analytics And City Science, 46(8), 1565–1580. Https://Doi. Org/10.1177/2399808319865749
- Pekanbaru.Go.Id. (2019). Wali Kota Pekanbaru Launching Kartu Smart Madani Dan KIA Di SMPN 4 Pekanbaru Pekanbaru. Pekanbaru. Pekanbaru. Pekanbaru. Pekanbaru. Pekanbaru. Pekanbaru. Pekanbaru.
- Putri, N. Aslamaturrahmah D., &Darmawan, E. (2018). E-Readiness Provinsi Kepulauan Riau Dalam Penerapan E-Government (Studi Terhadap Kepri Smart Province). KEMUDI: Jurnal Ilmu Pemerintahan, 3(1), 173–192. https://ojs.umrah.ac.id/index.php/kemudi/article/view/771/547
- Rafi, M., Nurmandi, A., &Afandi, S. A. (2020). Analisis Kegunaan Website Kementerian Agama Provinsi DIY Dan Provinsi Riau. Jurnal Komunikasi, 12(1), 92–107. https://Doi.Org/Http://Dx.Doi.Org/10.24912/Jk.V12i1.6960
- Ramdani, D. F., &Habibi, F. (2017). Penguatan Partisipasi Masyarakat Dalam Mendorong Program Smart City Di Kota Bandung. Prosiding Seminar Nasional Riset Terapan | SENASSET, 0(0), 125–129. https://ejurnal.lppmunsera.org/index.php/senasset/article/view/436
- Remahan.Com. (2020). Pekan Pangan Madani, Dinas Ketahanan Pangan Pekanbaru Sebut Masyarakat Antusias. Remahan.Com. http://ekonomi.remahan.com/read/pekan-pangan-madani-dinas-ketahanan-4xip0sm
- Rocco Papa, Adriana Galderisi, Maria Cristina Vigo Majello, E. S. (2015). Smart And Resilient Cities: A Systemic Approach For Developing Cross-Sectoral Strategies In The Face Of Climate Change. Tema: Journal Of Land Use, Mobility, And Environment, 8(1), 19–49. https://Doi.org/10.6092/1970-9870/2883
- Satrio, E. M., &Rochani, A. (2019). Efektifitas Penerapan Konsep Smart City Ditinjau Dari Aspek Indeks Pembangunan Manusia Di Kota Semarang. Pondasi, 24(2), 134. https://Doi.org/10.30659/Pondasi. V24i2.7642
- Siddique, W. (2016). Critical Success Factors Affecting E-Government Policy Implementation In Pakistan. Journal Of Edemocracy And Open Government, 8(1), 102–126. https://Doi.org/10.29379/Jedem. V811 398
- Situmorang, Y. (2015). PROSPEK PENGEMBANGAN INDUSTRI KREATIF SEKTOR PERIKLANAN (ADVERTISING) Di KOTA PEKANBARU. JOM Fekon, 2(2), 78849138. https://jom.unri.ac.id/index.php/ JOMFEKON/article/view/11682
- Suhartono, H. I., &Zulkarnain, I. (2019). Jurnal Ilmiah, Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia. Analisis Smart People In Smart City (Analisis Perilaku Masyarakat Tangerang Selatan Dalam Mewujudkan Kota Yang Cerdas), 2(2), 315–322. http://dx.doi.org/10.32493/JJSDM.v2i2.2236
- Suhono Harso Supangkat, Arry Akhmad Arman, Ryan Adhitya Nugraha, Y. A. F. (2018). The Implementation Of Garuda Smart City Framework For Smart City Readiness Mapping In Indonesia. Journal Of Asia Pasific Studies (Waseda University), 4(32), 169–176.
- Susanti, R., Soetomo, S., Buchori, I., &Brotosunaryo, P. M. (2016). Smart Growth, Smart City And Density: In Search Of The Appropriate Indicator For Residential Density In Indonesia. Procedia: Social And Behavioral Sciences, 227 (November), 194–201. https://Doi.org/10.1016/J.Sbspro.2016.06.062
- Terralogiq.Com. (2021). Perkembangan Dan Masa Depan Smart City Indonesia. Https://Terralogiq.Com/ Perkembangan-Dan-Masa-Depan-Smart-City-Indonesia/
- UGM, T. P. (2016). Road Map Kota Yogyakarta Menuju Smart City(Issue 1).
- Widodo, A., &Permatasari, D. A. (2020). Strategi Komunikasi Dalam Program Bekasi Smart City. ETTISAL: Journal Of Communication, 5(1). Https://Doi.Org/10.21111/Ejoc.V5i1.3454
- Yudantoro, P. (2016). Mewujudkan Kota Cerdas Berkelanjutan Infrastruktur PUPR Terpadu Untuk Negeri (H. Djamal (Ed.); 07 Ed.). Badan Pengembangan Infrastruktur Wilayah (BPIW) Kementerian PUPR.